

Contents

<i>List of Tables and Illustrations</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv

Introduction A Five-Week Election Night Ends Up in the Supreme Court	1
---	----------

1 The Supreme Court: Law or Politics? **7**

Defining the Dilemma, 11
Making Public Policy: Does the Supreme Court Take Part? 12
The Supreme Court, 17
Unraveling the Dilemma, 20
Statutory Construction: Changing the Meaning, 23
Judicial Review, 24
Overturing Precedent, 26
Interpreting and Revising Constitutional Provisions, 27
Evaluating the Role of the Supreme Court, 28
Conclusion, 30

2 The Historical Dimension of the Dilemma **33**

The Marshall Court (1801–1835), 36
The Taney Court (1836–1864), 38
Substantive Due Process, 39
The Preferred Position Doctrine: Selective Judicial Activism, 42
The Burger and Rehnquist Courts: Return to Restraint? 45
Conclusion, 47

3 The Democratic Dimension of the Dilemma: Unelected Policymaking 51

- Democratic Theory and the Supreme Court, 55
- Policymaking Against Majority Will, 58
- Review Compatible with Democratic Values, 60
- Deliberately Undemocratic, 62
- Are the Elected Branches Democratic? 63
- The Practical Realities of American Politics, 66
- A Pluralist Role for the Supreme Court, 67
- Rights and Liberties: The Province of the Supreme Court, 70
- Democratic Concerns Revisited, 72
- Conclusion, 74

4 The Institutional Dimension of the Dilemma: Constitutional and Self-Imposed Limitations 77

- The Limits of the Judicial Branch, 80
- Jurisdiction, 84
- Justiciability, 86
- Checks and Balances, 92
- Exposing the Supreme Court, 96
- The Power and Potential of the Supreme Court, 98
- Conclusion, 101

5 The Judicial Capacity Dimension of the Dilemma: Does the Supreme Court Have the Ability to Make Policy? 105

- The Supreme Court: Powerful Enough or Too Weak? 108
- The Supreme Court's Ability to Make Policy, 109
- Assessing Judicial Capacity, 111
- The Indictment Against the Judiciary, 116
- Viable Alternatives to the Judiciary, 119
- The Case for Relative Capacity, 120
- Is Capacity A Barrier? 126
- Conclusion, 128

**6 The Individual Dimension of the Dilemma:
The Bases for Decisions 131**

- The Dilemma for the Individual Justice, 135
- Legal Factors in Decisionmaking, 141
- Problems with the Legal Factors, 144
- Extralegal Factors in Decisionmaking, 147
- Relying on the Constitution: Legal or Extralegal? 149
- Reconciling the Two Perspectives, 151
- Conclusion, 153

**7 Toward Resolving the Dilemma:
A Return to the Recent Past 155**

- The Mysterious Branch of Government Nobody Knows, 157
- Recognizing the Constraints and Potential, 159
- Designing a Role for the Supreme Court, 162
- Protecting the Court’s Legitimacy, 168

References 171

Index 179