PARTI
THE NATURE OF THE LAW AND LEGAL SYSTEMS AND ITS HISTORICAL PRECEPTS

1 INTRODUCTION TO LAW AND LEGAL SYSTEMS IN THE COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN

THE NATURE OF THE LEGAL SYSTEM
A West Indian identity? 3
Turn toward other foreign law? 4
The plantation paradigm 4
Striving to be West Indian 5
The vulnerabilities of the legal system to socio-political realities 5
Economic and political sovereignty and the impact on law 6

PLURALISTIC SOCIETIES - RASTAFARIANISM AND BEYOND 6
Hindus and Muslims - ethnic and religious groups 7
The Rastafarians 8
The Orisha or Orisa 10
The failure to reflect minority interests in the law 11
The indigenous peoples 11

NEW AVENUES FOR LEGAL SYSTEMS - THE OFFSHORE
LEGAL SUBCULTURE 13
THE DEPENDENT TERRITORIES 14
REDEFINING LEGAL SYSTEMS 16
Funding justice 17

2 THE HISTORICAL FUNCTION OF LAW IN THE WEST INDIES - CREATING A FUTURE FROM A TROUBLED PAST

INTRODUCTION - THE GROUNDINGS OF HISTORY 18
Obeah Acts and Vagrancy Acts - laws to sustain inequity and dependence 21
## 3 Legal Traditions - Types of Legal Systems in the Commonwealth Caribbean

**Introduction - The Difficulty in Defining Legal Systems**

**The Concept of a Legal Tradition or Legal Family**

- Which criteria to be used?

**Distinguishing Criteria of Legal Traditions**

- Identifying major legal traditions

**The Common Law Legal Tradition**

**The Civil Law or Romano-Germanic Tradition**

- Civil law systems in CARICOM

**Similarities Between the Common Law and Civil Law Traditions**

**The Socialist Legal Tradition**

**The Religious Legal Traditions**

- Muslim law
- Hindu law

**Evidence of the Religious Legal Tradition in the Commonwealth Caribbean**

- Religious marriage and divorce
- Religious dress and expression
- Legal pluralism or legal tokenism?

**The Legal Tradition of the Far East**
CONCLUSION - WHITHER COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN LEGAL SYSTEMS? 55
   West Indian attitudes toward law 56
   Legal traditions of the Amerindians 57

4 THE HYBRID LEGAL SYSTEMS OF ST LUCIA AND GUYANA 58
   INTRODUCTION 58
   CLASSIFYING LEGAL TRADITIONS 58
   THE HYBRID PHENOMENON IN THE COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN 60
   THE GUYANESE EXPERIENCE 61
   THE HYBRID LEGAL SYSTEM OF ST LUCIA 63
   EROSION OF THE CIVIL LAW 65
      Law of contract under the Civil Code of St Lucia 66
      Influence of Quebec law 66
   DIFFICULTIES IN APPLYING ST LUCIA'S CIVIL CODE 68
      Family law under the Civil Code 69
      Interpretation of the Civil Code 69
   THE FUTURE OF THE HYBRID LEGAL SYSTEM 71

5 THE RECEPTION OR IMPOSITION OF LAW AND ITS SIGNIFICANCE TO CARIBBEAN JURISDICTIONS 73
   Rationale for imposition 74
   SETTLED COLONIES AND CONQUERED COLONIES 75
   THE METHOD AND DATE OF RECEPTION 77
      Reception of English statutory law 81
   CARIBBEAN ATTITUDES TO RECEPTION - STATIC OR CREATIVE? 81
   A CUT-OFF POINT FOR RECEPTION? 83
      The local circumstances rule 88
      Receiving law from jurisdictions other than England 91
   RECEPTION OF LAW AS A LIBERATING CONCEPT 92

PART II
THE SOURCES OF LAW IN THE COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN AND THEIR IMPACT ON THE LEGAL SYSTEM 93

6 INTRODUCTION TO SOURCES OF LAW 95
7 THE WRITTEN CONSTITUTION AS A LEGAL SOURCE

THE NATURE AND IMPORTANCE OF THE CONSTITUTION

 Constitutional supremacy
 Functions of the Constitution
 Form and structure of the Constitution

THE PROTECTION OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS - A DYNAMIC LEGAL SOURCE?

SAVING LAW CLAUSES

 Changes to saving law approaches

PURPOSIVE INTERPRETATION AND THE ATTITUDE OF THE COURTS

 Due process and the rule of law

THE PREAMBLE TO THE BILL OF RIGHTS

HIJACKING THE CONSTITUTION AND CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM?

DIRECTIONS IN CONSTITUTIONAL JURISPRUDENCE

ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

SEPARATION OF POWERS

ENTRENCHMENT OF CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS

MEASURING THE VALIDITY OF OTHER LAWS AND LEGAL SOURCES

 The validation of other legal sources

8 THE COMMON LAW AND THE OPERATION OF THE DOCTRINE OF JUDICIAL PRECEDENT IN THE COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN

INTRODUCTION TO THE COMMON LAW

THE DOCTRINE OF JUDICIAL PRECEDENT - CHARACTER AND RATIONALE

 Binding precedent
 Persuasive precedents

ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES OF THE DOCTRINE OF JUDICIAL PRECEDENT

 Precedents relevant to social contexts

THE HIERARCHY OF COURTS

CONCEPTS IMPORTANT TO THE DOCTRINE OF PRECEDENT

 The ratio decidendi
 Locating the ratio decidendi
 Obiter dicta
 Statements of law made per incuriam and per curiam
THE IMPORTANCE OF LAW REPORTING

AVOIDING PRECEDENT - THE PROMOTION OF FLEXIBILITY

   Overruling decisions
   Prospective overruling
   Exceptions to precedent in the face of *per incuriam* or *obiter* statements
   Precedents based on assumptions of law
   Distinguishing precedent
   Reversing a decision
   First impression decisions

THE DECLARATORY PRECEDENT AND THE OVERRULING OF PRECEDENT - NEW DEVELOPMENTS

   Challenges to the declaratory theory - creating new legal rules
   Persistent overruling

CIRCUMSTANCES IN WHICH FINAL COURTS SHOULD OVERRULE

   Finding the balance - the priority for judicial development

RULES OF PRECEDENT FOR COURTS OF APPEAL

   Earlier Court of Appeal decisions
   Deviation for criminal jurisdiction
   Previous Privy Council Decisions where appeals to Privy Council have been abolished

RULES OF PRECEDENT FOR THE PRIVY COUNCIL

   Where Privy Council precedent conflicts with House of Lord precedents
   The CCJ and precedent
   Implications where highest court not bound to precedent

DECISIONS OF HIGH COURTS

MAGISTRATES' COURTS AND *STARE DECISIS*

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW DECISIONS

THE CARIBBEAN PERSPECTIVE - DIFFICULTIES WITH HIERARCHY IN THE OPERATION OF PRECEDENT

   A complex hierarchical structure of courts
   Pre-independence courts
   Decisions from other Caribbean Courts of Appeal
   Sub-regional courts

DECISIONS OF THE REGIONAL FINAL COURTS - THE PRIVY COUNCIL AND THE CCJ: REGIONAL OR DOMESTIC?

   Privy Council decisions from other jurisdictions binding in practice
   Authority for refusing Privy Council precedents from other jurisdictions
The CCJ and precedents from other jurisdictions 152
A homogeneous jurisprudence 153

DECISIONS FROM THE HOUSE OF LORDS AND OTHER ENGLISH COURTS - THE DESIRE FOR CONSISTENCY IN THE COMMON LAW 153
Status of decisions from the UK House of Lords 153

CODIFIED COMMON LAW 155
Local circumstances rule and precedent 156

PRECEDENT AND THE RECEPTION OF LAW AS DECLARED IN THE CARIBBEAN 156

CAN CARIBBEAN JUDGES MAKE LAW? 159

MOULDING THE COMMON LAW AMIDST LOCAL CIRCUMSTANCES 161
An indigenous jurisprudence from a Caribbean Court of Justice 163

CONCLUSION - A DIRECTION FOR CARIBBEAN PRECEDENT 164

9 EQUITY AS A SOURCE OF LAW 166

INTRODUCTION - THE DUAL STRUCTURE OF THE COMMON LAW 166

THE HISTORICAL JUSTIFICATION FOR AND DEVELOPMENT OF EQUITY 167

THE COURT OF CHANCERY 168

THE NATURE AND CONTENT OF EQUITY 168
'Maxims of equity' 169
New rights and remedies 170

THE MODERN EXPRESSION OF EQUITY 171

THE ROLE OF THE LEGISLATURE IN CREATING EQUITABLE PRINCIPLES AND OFFSHORE DEVELOPMENTS 171

NEW DEVELOPMENTS BY THE COURTS 172

OFFSHORE LEGISLATIVE DEVELOPMENTS 173
The offshore trust in equity 173

OFFSHORE JURISPRUDENCE AND THE MAREVA INJUNCTION 174

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE COMMON LAW AND EQUITY 176

10 CUSTOM AS A SOURCE OF LAW 177
CUSTOM 177
THE COMMON LAW RULES OF CUSTOM 177
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THE APPLICATION OF CUSTOM IN THE CARIBBEAN</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overcoming restrictive rules on custom</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Custom under the St Lucia Civil Code</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CUSTOM AND LAND OWNERSHIP</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Indian chattel houses</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Succession</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family law issues</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFORMS BASED ON CUSTOM</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIFFICULTIES IDENTIFYING CUSTOM THROUGH ORAL TRADITIONS</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AND CUSTOM</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROPERTY RIGHTS OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES - LINKING CUSTOM</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WITH COMITY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The recognition of native title</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assertions to native title by the Mayas and the Maroons</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifying the group</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency in indigenous custom</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuity in indigenous custom</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How distinguished?</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International law aspects</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CUSTOM OR COMITY?</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COLLECTIVE RIGHTS AND WEST INDIAN CUSTOM</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE INSULARITY OF THE COMMON LAW AND THE IMPACT ON CUSTOM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 CONVENTION AS A LEGAL SOURCE</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 INTERNATIONAL LAW AS A SOURCE OF LAW</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE NATURE AND STATUS OF INTERNATIONAL LAW</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incorporation of treaties</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS FROM INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND BODIES</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International decisions and human rights</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDIVIDUAL RIGHTS TO PETITION INTERNATIONAL BODIES</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WITHDRAWAL FROM THE IAHRC AND THE UNHRC</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict between international law and domestic concerns</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAT IS INTERNATIONAL CUSTOM?</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERNATIONAL LAW, MUNICIPAL LAW AND THE CONSTITUTION</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REGIONAL LAW
The CARICOM Treaty
The Organisation of American States

THE ENFORCEABILITY AND JUSTICIABILITY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

INCONSISTENT APPROACHES, INTERNATIONALISM VERSUS LEGISLATIVE SUPREMACY
Unincorporated treaties revisited - distinction between Boyce and earlier cases
The implications of Boyce for the enforceability of international law
Due process and legitimate expectation - new rights or new routes?
The Teoh precedent on legitimate expectations to treaty rights
Danger of a broad interpretation of the Boyce principle
Reiterate the traditional position
The net result of Boyce and related case law

CONCLUSION

13 LEGISLATION AS A SOURCE OF LAW
THE IMPORTANCE OF LEGISLATION
THE NATURE AND ROLE OF LEGISLATION
FUNCTIONS OF LEGISLATION
TYPES OF LEGISLATION
ORDERS IN COUNCIL FROM THE PREROGATIVE
ACTS OF PARLIAMENT
DELEGATED OR SUBSIDIARY LEGISLATION
Regulations or orders
Bylaws
FUNCTIONS OF DELEGATED LEGISLATION
Speed and efficiency
Technicality
Special knowledge
Flexibility
Bulk
Future developments
AUTONOMIC LEGISLATION
CONTROLLING THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS
Controlling Acts of Parliament
PARLIAMENTARY CONTROL OF DELEGATED LEGISLATION 237

JUDICIAL CONTROL OF DELEGATED LEGISLATION 238
  Procedural ultra vires 239
  Substantive ultra vires 240
  Injustice and unconstitutionality 241

CRITICISMS OF DELEGATED LEGISLATION 242

14 STATUTORY INTERPRETATION 243

INTRODUCTION 243
  Seeking Parliament's intention 245

THE RULES CONSIDERED 245
  The literal rule 245
  The golden rule 250
  The mischief rule 253
  The implications of the mischief rule 254

CONTEMPORARY APPROACHES 255
  The unified contextual approach 255
  The purposive approach 256
  The Constitution and the purposive approach 258
  The policy approach 259

RULES OF LANGUAGE AND PRESUMPTIONS 259
  Ejusdem generis 259
  Expressio unius est exclusio alterius 261
  Noscitur a sociis 261
  Mandatory versus directory 261

PRESUMPTIONS OF STATUTORY INTERPRETATION 262

AIDS TO INTERPRETATION 266
  Internal aids 266
  External aids 270
  A possible retreat from Pepper v Hart 274
  Other external aids 276
  Pari materia statutes as aids 277
  Using later statutes to assist in interpretation 277

THE MODERN APPROACH TO STATUTORY INTERPRETATION 277

SPECIAL APPROACHES TO STATUTORY INTERPRETATION IN THE COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN 278
  The local circumstances rule 279
SPECIAL APPROACHES TO INTERPRETING CONSTITUTIONS 280
The presumption that legislation is *intra vires* the Constitution 280
How does one rebut the presumption of constitutionality? 282
The purposive construction of Constitutions 283
Saving law or existing law clauses 284
International law influences on the Constitution as an aid to interpretation 285
Provisions found in the Preamble 285

PART III
THE ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE IN THE COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN 287

15 THE COURT SYSTEM OF THE COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN 289

INFERIOR COURTS 290
Stipendiary magistrates and circuit magistrates 290
Resident magistrates' courts 292
Hybrid offences 292

SUPERIOR COURTS OF RECORD 293
Jurisdiction of superior courts 293

THE EASTERN CARIBBEAN SUPREME COURT 296

GRENADA'S REVOLUTIONARY EXPERIMENT WITH A FINAL SUPREME COURT 297

THE ALCALDE COURTS IN BELIZE 298

THE JUDICIARY 298
Judges with political backgrounds 302

PROBLEMS ADMINISTERING JUSTICE 303
Lack of resources and delay - the impact of underdevelopment 304
Legal representation and legal aid 304
Access to the courts 305

16 THE PRIVY COUNCIL 307

CARIBBEAN CROSSROADS - FROM THE PRIVY COUNCIL TO A REGIONAL SUPREME COURT 307
Status of the Privy Council and power to abolish appeals 307

METHOD OF ABOLISHING APPEALS 309

ASSUMPTION OF APPELLATE JURISDICTION 310
Self-limits on jurisdiction 312
New evidence and damages 313
Civil appeals 313
Constitutional matters 314
Limited access to appeals 314

REPLACING THE PRIVY COUNCIL WITH A CARIBBEAN COURT OF JUSTICE 315
Sovereignty and nationhood 316
The appropriate role for the Privy Council 316
Arguments on dependency 319
Cost of justice 320
Competence of Caribbean peoples - a leap to enlightenment 321
Our unrecognised contribution to the Privy Council's jurisprudence 323
Impartiality 324
A hypocritical jurisprudence? 326
Composition of the court and final concerns 326

17 THE RENEWED INITIATIVE TOWARDS A CARIBBEAN COURT OF JUSTICE 328
Rationale for establishing the CCJ 329
The Constitution of the Caribbean Court of Justice 332
Funding arrangements for the CCJ 332
Appointment of judges 333

THE JURISDICTION OF THE CARIBBEAN COURT OF JUSTICE 333
Differences in jurisdiction 333

APPELLATE JURISDICTION 333
The CCJ and precedent 335
The CCJ's attitude to Privy Council and other precedents 336
Overruling by the CCJ 338

THE CCJ'S ORIGINAL JURISDICTION 338
Power to enforce decisions in international law 339
Relationship with domestic courts 340
Nature of the CCJ's original jurisdiction 341
Exclusive original jurisdiction 341
Stare decisis 342
Access to the courts by individuals 343
Practical difficulties of the CCJ's operation 343

THE FUTURE OF CARIBBEAN LEGAL SYSTEMS UNDER THE CARIBBEAN COURT OF JUSTICE 343

18 SPECIALISED COURTS, TRIBUNALS AND FUNCTIONS 345
THE CONCEPT OF SPECIALISED FUNCTIONS 345
THE STATUS OF SPECIALISED COURTS

INDUSTRIAL COURTS

THE INDUSTRIAL COURT OF TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO
  Status and appeals
  Personnel
  Jurisdiction

THE INDUSTRIAL COURT OF ANTIGUA

EFFECTIVENESS OF THE INDUSTRIAL COURTS

THE FAMILY COURT
  Personnel and procedure
  Jurisdiction

JUVENILE COURTS
  The impact of the Convention on the Rights of the Child
  Who is a juvenile?
  Age of criminal responsibility
  Jurisdiction over juveniles
  Constitution and procedure
  Juvenile offenders
  Privacy and assistance
  Evidence from children and the oath
  Sentencing options
  In need of care and protection
  Legal aid for juveniles
  New developments in the control of juveniles

PROBLEMS WITH JUVENILE JUSTICE - THEORY VERSUS REALITY
  Protection goals and the problem with status offences
  Problems with sentencing options
  Public perception
  Juvenile delinquency - a legal and sociological concept
  Psychological and mental problems and the lack of remedial measures
  Constitutional issues
  Locating the juvenile
  Adequate facilities
  Class and gender concerns

THE GUN COURT

REVENUE COURTS
  Jamaica
  Trinidad and Tobago
19 THE JURY SYSTEM

THE NATURE AND COMPOSITION OF THE JURY

THE SPECIAL JURY

THE RIGHT TO TRIAL BY JURY

CIVIL TRIALS

THE ELECTION TO SUMMARY TRIAL

THE REPRESENTATIVE NATURE OF THE JURY

CHALLENGES TO THE JURY

DISCHARGING THE JURY

DISCHARGE OF THE ENTIRE JURY

Jury confidentiality

SIZE OF THE JURY

EXAMINING THE MERITS OF TRIAL BY JURY

Determining the difference between fact and law

Incompetence and ignorance

Perception and emotional considerations

PROBLEMS WITH THE REPRESENTATIVENESS OF THE JURY

QUESTIONS OF RACE AND ETHNICITY

GENDER EQUALITY

MISDIRECTIONS TO THE JURY - PROCEDURAL IRREGULARITIES

Judge to present a balanced direction to jury

QUESTIONING THE VALIDITY OF THE VERDICT

THE THRESHOLD FOR OVERTURNING A VERDICT

THE ISSUE OF SIZE - PRE-TRIAL PREJUDICE AND OTHER PROBLEMS

LOCAL KNOWLEDGE OF THE JURY

OTHER JURY INFLUENCES

ALTERNATIVES TO JURY TRIALS

ADVANTAGES OF THE JURY SYSTEM

Participatory justice

20 THE OFFICE OF THE OMBUDSMAN

INTRODUCTION
NATURE OF THE OFFICE - APPOINTMENT AND REMOVAL 408
Consensual and accessible approach 410

JURISDICTION AND FUNCTIONS 410

THE OMBUDSMAN'S JURISDICTION IN PROTECTING HUMAN RIGHTS 413
Exclusions from jurisdiction 416

PROCEDURE 417

PROBLEMS WITH THE OMBUDSMAN'S OFFICE 418

POSITIVE FEATURES OF THE INSTITUTION AND TRENDS FOR THE FUTURE 421
IMPACT AND CONCLUSION 423

21 ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE MECHANISMS - ARBITRATION, NEGOTIATION AND COMMISSIONS OF INQUIRY 424

ARBITRATION, NEGOTIATION AND CONCILIATION 424

ARBITRATION AND NEGOTIATION IN LABOUR RELATIONS 425

VOLUNTARY ARBITRATION AND NEGOTIATION 425

COMPULSORY ARBITRATION 426

ARBITRATION FOR DISPUTES AGAINST THE PUBLIC OR NATIONAL INTEREST AND ESSENTIAL SERVICES 427

COMMISSIONS OF INQUIRY 427
Nature and functions of Commissions of Inquiry 427

APPOINTMENT OF COMMISSIONS OF INQUIRY 429
Impartiality of Commissioners 430

NATURAL JUSTICE AND PROCEDURE BEFORE COMMISSIONS OF INQUIRY 431
Access to the public 433
Witnesses before Commissions of Inquiry 434

Bibliography 435
Index 441