

Table of Contents

	Page
PREFACE	v
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	ix
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS	xi
TABLE OF CASES.....	xxxix
Chapter 1. The General Assumptions and Rationale of Forensic Identification	1
1-1.0 Introduction	2
1-1.1 What Makes Something "Forensic?"	4
1-1.2 What Is Expected of the Forensic Sciences?.....	4
1-1.3 Subordination of "Scientific Truth" to "Legal Truth"	4
1-2.0 Comparison	5
1-2.1 Class and Individual Characteristics.....	5
1-2.2 Features	7
1-2.3 Feature Independence.....	7
1-3.0 Identification and Individualization	8
1-3.1 Identification Processes v. Comparison Processes.....	9
1-3.2 Explicable Differences	10
1-4.0 Evaluation of Source.....	10
1-4.1 "Same as That" vs. "Born of That"	11
1-4.2 Uniqueness	12
1-5.0 Science and the Scientific Method.....	13
1-5.1 Science	13
1-5.2 Scientific Method	13
1-5.3 Induction and Deduction	14
1-5.4 Failure of the Forensic Sciences to Consistently Appreciate the Implications of the Scientific Method	14
1-5.5 Substitution of Intuition or Experience for Defensible Scientific Fact.....	16
1-5.6 Legal Skepticism Concerning Case-Oriented Research	18
1-6.0 Standards of Operation, Standards of Performance	18
1-6.1 Reliability, Validity, Precision, and Accuracy	19
1-6.2 Expression of Certainty of Opinions	20
1-6.3 The Mismeasure of Evidence.....	20
1-6.4 Proficiency Testing as a Means of Ensuring Quality in Technical Procedures	21
1-6.5 Signal Detection Theory and Proficiency Testing	22
1-7.0 Issues of Professional Practice	23
1-7.1 Documentation of Findings.....	23

	Page
1-7.2 Statistical Basis for Evidence Evaluation	24
1-7.3 Personal Bias in Observation and Interpretation	25
1-7.4 Physical Evidence Is Not the Property of One Side or the Other	26
1-8.0 Subjective Tests vs. Objective Tests	26
1-9.0 Vulnerability of Physical Evidence Categories in Light of <i>Daubert</i> Criteria	28
1-9.1 <i>Daubert</i> Criteria	28
1-9.2 Forensic Identification Subspecialties	29
1-9.2.1 Blood and Other Physiological Fluids	29
1-9.2.2 Glass	33
1-9.2.3 Hair Evidence	35
1-9.2.4 Fiber Evidence	36
1-9.2.5 Fingerprint Evidence	38
1-9.2.6 Soil and Mineral Evidence	40
1-9.2.7 Handwriting	41
1-9.2.8 Narcotics and Drugs of Abuse	43
1-9.2.9 Voiceprints	44
1-9.2.10 Bitemarks	44
1-9.2.11 Arson and Fire Evidence	45
1-9.2.12 Toolmark and Firearms Evidence	46
Chapter 2. Fingerprint Identification	61
A. Legal Issues	62
2-1.0 The Judicial Response to Proffered Expert Testimony on Fingerprint Identification	62
2-1.1 Admissibility Prior to <i>Daubert</i>	65
2-1.2 Post- <i>Daubert</i> Challenges in Federal Courts	69
2-1.3 Post- <i>Daubert</i> Challenges in State Courts	78
B. Scientific Status	82
2-2.0 The Scientific Basis of Expert Testimony on Fingerprint Identification	82
2-2.1 Introductory Discussion of the Science	82
2-2.1.1 The Scientific Questions	82
2-2.1.2 The Scientific Methods Applied in the Research	85
2-2.2 Areas of Scientific Agreement	96
2-2.2.1 Constancy of Patterns	97
2-2.2.2 Sufficiency of Identifying Details	97
2-2.2.3 Storage and Retrieval	97
2-2.2.4 Crime Scene Prints	97
2-2.2.5 Identification and Interpretation	98
2-2.2.6 Training, Experience and Ability of Fin- gerprint Examiners	98
2-2.3 Areas of Scientific Disagreement	99
2-2.3.1 The Question of Standards and the Basis for Concluding an Absolute Identifica- tion	99

	Page
B. Scientific Status—Continued	
2-2.3.2 Questions of Standard Practices, Proficiency Testing, Self-Regulation and Empirical Validation	102
2-2.3.3 The Question of Opinions of Qualified Association	104
2-2.3.4 The Question of Exclusionary Value	104
2-2.3.5 The Possibility of Forged or Planted Fingerprints	105
2-2.3.6 Fingerprint Documentation and Reporting	105
2-2.3.7 Omission of Fingerprint Processing and Disposal of Latent Lifts.....	106
2-2.4 Future Directions.....	107
Chapter 3. Handwriting Identification	113
A. Legal Issues	114
3-1.0 The Judicial Response to Proffered Expert Testimony on Handwriting Identification by Comparison of Hands	114
3-1.1 Introductory Note	114
3-1.2 Early Legal History	115
3-1.3 Admissibility in American Jurisdictions.....	117
3-1.4 Recent Developments.....	120
3-1.4.1 Implications of <i>Kumho Tire v. Carmichael</i>	121
3-1.4.2 Admissibility of Asserted Handwriting Expert Testimony Before <i>Kumho Tire</i>	122
3-1.4.3 Admissibility of Asserted Handwriting Expert Testimony After <i>Kumho Tire</i>	134
3-1.4.4 Counter-testimony on FDEs' Claimed Skills.....	139
3-1.4.5 Law Review Literature.....	142
B. Scientific Status.....	143
3-2.0 The Scientific Status of Handwriting Identification Expertise	143
3-2.1 Introduction.....	143
3-2.2 Areas of Agreement: The Possibility of a Science of Handwriting Identification	143
3-2.2.1 Proposed Principles of Handwriting Identification	146
3-2.2.2 A Summary of Handwriting Identification Practice	147
3-2.3 Areas of Disagreement: Testing Document Examiner Expertise	154
3-2.3.1 Forensic Sciences Foundation Proficiency Tests: 1975-1987	157
3-2.3.2 The Risinger et al. Evaluation of the 1975-1987 FSF Studies.....	160
3-2.3.3 The Galbraiths' Critique of Exorcism and Their Proposed Reanalysis of the FSF Studies	162
3-2.3.4 Forensic Sciences Foundation Proficiency Tests: 1988-1989	166

	Page
B. Scientific Status—Continued	
3-2.3.5 The Galbraith Administration of the 1987 FSF Test to Non-Experts	170
3-2.3.6 The Studies by Kam and Associates	171
3-2.3.7 Conclusions	190
3-2.4 Future Directions	191
3-2.4.1 Interdependence of Research and Court Decisions	191
3-2.4.2 Computer Authentication and Identifica- tion of Handwriting	193
Chapter 4. Firearms and Toolmark Identification	194
A. Legal Issues	194
4-1.0 The Judicial Response to Firearms and Toolmark Identifica- tion Expert Evidence	194
4-1.1 Toolmark Identification	195
4-1.2 Firearms Examination	199
4-1.3 Post- <i>Daubert</i> Decisions	201
4-1.4 Conclusion	204
B. Scientific Issues	205
4-2.0 The Scientific Basis of Firearms and Toolmark Identification	205
4-2.1 Introductory Discussion of the Science	205
4-2.1.1 The Scientific Questions	206
4-2.1.2 The Scientific Methods Applied in Fire- arms and Toolmark Examination	210
4-2.2 Areas of Scientific Agreement	213
4-2.3 Areas of Scientific Disagreement	216
4-2.3.1 Disagreement About the Scientific Foun- dations	216
4-2.3.2 Disagreement Among Practitioners in Par- ticular Applications	217
4-2.4 Development of Objective Criteria for Identification	219
4-2.5 Future Directions	226
Chapter 5. Identification from Bitemarks	231
A. Legal Issues	232
5-1.0 The Legal Relevance of Research on Bitemark Identification	232
5-1.1 Bitemark Identification and the <i>Daubert</i> Factors	232
5-1.2 Divergence of Opinions by Bitemark Experts	233
5-1.3 The Judicial Response to Expert Testimony on Bite- mark Identification	235
5-1.3.1 Cases Before <i>Daubert</i>	236
5-1.3.2 Cases After <i>Daubert</i>	240
B. Scientific Issues	244
5-2.0 The Scientific Status of Bitemark Comparisons	244
5-2.1 Introductory Discussion of the Scientific Status of Bitemark Comparisons	244
5-2.1.1 Areas of Dental Testimony	245
5-2.1.2 Training and Professional Forensic Orga- nizations	247

	Page
B. Scientific Issues—Continued	
5-2.1.3 Recognition and Analysis of Human Bite- marks.....	247
5-2.1.4 Scientific Methods Applied to Comparison Techniques.....	252
5-2.1.5 The Scientific Limitations of Bitemark Testimony.....	254
5-2.1.6 Scientific Literature on Bitemark Identifi- cation.....	259
5-2.1.7 Technical Advancements.....	265
5-2.2 Areas of Scientific Agreement.....	269
5-2.2.1 Evidence Collection.....	269
5-2.2.2 Analysis and Comparison of Bitemarks.....	270
5-2.3 Areas of Scientific Disagreement.....	271
5-2.4 Unresolved Issues.....	271
5-2.5 Future Directions.....	273
Chapter 6. Talker Identification.....	294
A. Legal Issues.....	295
6-1.0 The Judicial Response to Proffered Expert Testimony on Talker Identification.....	295
6-1.1 Pre- <i>Daubert</i> Decisions.....	295
6-1.2 State Decisions Post- <i>Daubert</i>	300
6-1.3 Federal Decisions Post- <i>Daubert</i>	302
B. Scientific Status.....	304
6-2.0 The Scientific Basis of Expert Testimony on Talker Identifi- cation.....	304
6-2.1 Introductory Discussion of the Science.....	304
6-2.1.1 The Scientific Questions.....	304
6-2.1.2 Scientific Methods Applied in Talker Identifi- cation Research.....	315
6-2.2 Areas of Scientific Agreement.....	321
6-2.2.1 Signal Transmission and Recording.....	323
6-2.2.2 Phonetic Context and Duration.....	323
6-2.2.3 Disguises and Mimicking.....	324
6-2.2.4 Psychological or Physical State of the Talker.....	324
6-2.2.5 Earwitness Testimony.....	326
6-2.2.6 Summary.....	328
6-2.3 Areas of Scientific Disagreement.....	328
6-2.4 Future Directions.....	330
Chapter 7. Fires, Arsons and Explosions.....	338
A. Legal Issues.....	339
7-1.0 The Legal Response to Expert Testimony on Fires and Explo- sions.....	339
7-1.1 Introduction.....	339
7-1.2 Before <i>Kumho Tire</i> : Are Fire Experts Subject to <i>Daubert</i> Scrutiny?.....	341
7-1.3 Other Aspects of Admissibility and Exclusion of Fire Experts.....	344

	Page
A. Legal Issues—Continued	
7-1.3.1 The Qualifications of the Expert.....	344
7-1.3.2 Novelty.....	346
7-1.3.3 Basis in Experience versus in Empirically Tested Knowledge.....	347
7-1.4 Accelerant-Detecting Canines.....	348
7-1.5 On Whom Can Fire Experts Rely for the Data on Which They Base Their Conclusions?.....	349
7-1.6 Who Bears the Burden of Proof in a <i>Daubert</i> Hear- ing?.....	350
7-1.7 Nature of Scrutiny Following <i>Kumho Tire</i>	351
7-1.8 State Cases.....	354
B. Scientific Status.....	355
7-2.0 The Scientific Basis of Expert Testimony on Fires, Arsons, and Explosions.....	355
7-2.1 Introductory Discussion of the Science.....	355
7-2.1.1 Field Investigations.....	357
7-2.1.2 Laboratory Analysis.....	361
7-2.1.3 Sources.....	362
7-2.2 Areas of Scientific Agreement and Disagreement.....	365
7-2.2.1 Field Investigations.....	365
7-2.2.2 Laboratory Analysis.....	381
7-2.3 Future Directions.....	384
Chapter 8. Alcohol Testing	388
A. Legal Issues.....	389
8-1.0 Legal Issues in Alcohol Testing.....	389
8-1.1 Introduction.....	389
8-1.2 Validity of the Underlying Theory or Principle.....	392
8-1.2.1 Novel Scientific Evidence.....	392
8-1.2.2 Chemical, Biochemical and Gas Chroma- tography Tests.....	393
8-1.2.3 Time of Testing.....	393
8-1.2.4 Breath Tests.....	397
8-1.2.5 Horizontal Gaze Nystagmus (HGN).....	399
8-1.2.6 Field Sobriety Tests.....	406
8-1.3 General Technique.....	408
8-1.3.1 Procedures Mandated by Statute.....	408
8-1.3.2 Chain of Custody.....	409
8-1.4 Specific Technique.....	410
8-1.5 Conclusion.....	413
B. Scientific Status.....	414
8-2.0 Testing for Alcohol: Forensic Issues.....	414
8-2.1 Introduction.....	414
8-2.2 Pharmacology and Toxicology of Ethyl Alcohol.....	415
8-2.2.1 Interpretation of Alcohol Concentrations... ..	415
8-2.2.2 Effects of Alcohol on the Central Nervous System.....	416
8-2.2.3 Effects of Alcohol in Combination With Other Drugs.....	423

	Page
B. Scientific Status—Continued	
8-2.3 Alcohol Testing Procedures.....	425
8-2.3.1 Blood and Body Fluids.....	425
8-2.3.2 Breath Testing.....	433
8-2.4 Interpretation of Alcohol Results in Biological Specimens.....	439
8-2.4.1 Analytical Considerations.....	439
8-2.4.2 Distribution of Alcohol in the Body.....	440
8-2.4.3 Postmortem Effects on Blood Alcohol Concentrations.....	443
8-2.4.4 Acute Ethyl Alcohol Fatalities.....	446
8-2.5 Pharmacokinetics and Forensic Extrapolations.....	446
Chapter 9. Drug Testing	459
A. Legal Issues.....	460
9-1.0 Legal Issues in Drug Testing.....	460
9-1.1 Introduction.....	460
9-1.2 Validity of the Underlying Theory or Principle.....	463
9-1.2.1 Hair.....	464
9-1.2.2 EMIT Drug Tests.....	468
9-1.2.3 Other Drug Tests.....	468
9-1.2.4 Timing.....	472
9-1.2.5 Horizontal Gaze Nystagmus (HGN) and Drug Recognition Evaluation (DRE) Protocol.....	472
9-1.3 General Technique.....	484
9-1.3.1 EMIT and Other Preliminary Tests.....	485
9-1.3.2 Chain of Custody.....	489
9-1.3.3 Procedures Mandated by Statute.....	491
9-1.4 Specific Technique.....	493
9-1.5 Conclusion.....	494
B. Scientific Status.....	494
9-2.0 Drug Use: Evidence From Surveys and Chemical Testing.....	494
9-2.1 Introductory Discussion of the Science.....	494
9-2.1.1 Strengths and Limitations of Self-Reported Data.....	495
9-2.1.2 Strengths and Limitations of Chemical Testing Data.....	498
9-2.2 Drug Use Survey Findings for Selected Populations... ..	499
9-2.2.1 High School Senior Surveys.....	499
9-2.2.2 National Household Surveys on Drug Abuse.....	502
9-2.2.3 Military Worldwide Surveys.....	505
9-2.2.4 Jail and Prison Inmate Surveys.....	508
9-2.3 Two Worlds of Drug Use.....	514
9-2.4 Summary of Survey Findings.....	516
9-2.5 The Pharmacokinetics of Drugs.....	517
9-2.6 Specimen Selection.....	518
9-2.6.1 Postmortem Testing.....	518
9-2.6.2 DUI Testing.....	520

	Page
B. Scientific Status—Continued	
9-2.6.3 Workplace Testing.....	521
9-2.7 Chemical Testing Methods.....	521
9-2.7.1 Thin-Layer Chromatography (TLC).....	522
9-2.7.2 Immunoassays (IAs)	524
9-2.7.3 Gas Chromatography (GC)	526
9-2.7.4 High-Performance or High-Pressure Liquid Chromatography (HPLC).....	530
9-2.7.5 Tandem (MS/MS) and Ion Trap Mass Spectrometry.....	532
9-2.7.6 Summary and Comparison of Chemical Methods.....	533
9-2.8 Method Validation	534
9-2.8.1 Qualitative and Quantitative Methods.....	534
9-2.8.2 Specificity	534
9-2.8.3 Sensitivity.....	535
9-2.8.4 Linearity.....	535
9-2.8.5 Precision.....	535
9-2.8.6 Accuracy.....	536
9-2.9 Good Laboratory Practices.....	536
9-2.9.1 Laboratory Certification.....	536
9-2.9.2 Chain-of-Custody Procedures and Documents	538
9-2.9.3 Quality Control Samples and Procedures ...	538
9-2.9.4 Quality Assurance	539
9-2.9.5 Records.....	540
9-2.10 Interpretation	541
9-2.10.1 Medical Examiner Cases.....	541
9-2.10.2 Workplace Urine Drug Tests.....	542
9-2.10.3 Drugs and Driving Cases.....	544
9-2.11 Current and Developing Issues.....	547
9-2.11.1 Current Drugs of Forensic Interest.....	547
9-2.11.2 Current Specimens of Forensic Interest.....	548
Chapter 10. Polygraph Tests.....	555
A. Legal Issues	558
10-1.0 The Legal Relevance of Scientific Research on Polygraph Tests.....	558
10-1.1 Introduction	558
10-1.2 Admissibility	559
10-1.2.1 <i>Per Se</i> Exclusion	559
10-1.2.2 Discretionary Admission	561
10-1.2.3 Admissibility by Stipulation.....	565
10-1.2.4 Corroboration and Impeachment Purposes	567
10-1.3 Confessions Before, During and After Polygraph Examinations	569
10-1.4 Polygraph Evidence and Constitutional Guarantees ...	570
10-1.5 Conclusion	572

	Page
B. Scientific Status.....	573
10-2.0 The Scientific Status of Research on Polygraph Techniques: The Case for Polygraph Tests	573
10-2.1 Introductory Discussion of the Science	573
10-2.1.1 Background	573
10-2.1.2 Psychophysiological Detection of Deception Techniques.....	575
10-2.2 Areas of Scientific Agreement and Disagreement	578
10-2.2.1 Survey of the Accuracy of Polygraph Tests	578
10-2.2.2 Countermeasures	589
10-2.2.3 The Polygraph in Practice	592
10-2.2.4 General Acceptance of Polygraph Testing by the Scientific Community	593
10-2.3 Major Developments and Future Prospects	597
10-2.4 Misconceptions About Control (Comparison) Ques- tions.....	599
10-2.4.1 Inconsistency, Selectivity, and Misrepre- sentations	600
10-2.4.2 The Friendly Polygrapher	604
10-2.4.3 The Polygraph and Juries.....	606
10-2.5 Conclusions	606
10-3.0 The Scientific Status of Research on Polygraph Techniques: The Case Against Polygraph Tests.....	609
10-3.1 Introductory Discussion of the Science	609
10-3.1.1 Background.....	610
10-3.1.2 The Scientific Questions and Methods.....	614
10-3.2 Areas of Scientific Agreement and Disagreement	617
10-3.2.1 The Relevant Scientific Community.....	617
10-3.2.2 Why the CQT is Not a Test.....	618
10-3.2.3 The CQT Has Unknown Reliability.....	620
10-3.3.4 Implausibility of CQT Theory	621
10-3.3.5 Intractable Problems Inherent to the Eval- uation of CQT Theory.....	625
10-3.3.6 How to Identify Scientifically Credible Studies	628
10-3.3.7 CQT Accuracy: Claims of CQT Proponents Are Not Supported	631
10-3.2.8 How Guilty Persons Can Learn to Produce Truthful CQT Outcomes	636
10-3.3.9 Why Computerization Does Not Boost CQT Accuracy	636
10-3.3.10 The Limited Research on the Directed Lie Version of the CQT	637
10-3.3.11 Why Law Enforcement Agencies Use Poly- graph Tests Despite Their Limitations	638
10-3.3.12 Scientists Are Skeptical of the CQT	639
10-3.3.13 Scientifically Based Forensic Psychophy- siology: The Guilty Knowledge Test (GKT)	647

	Page
B. Scientific Status—Continued	
10-3.3.14 Polygraph Screening of Federal Employees and Job Applicants	654
10-3.4 Summary of Areas of Agreement: Topics for Future Research	658
10-3.4.1 The Future of the “Lie Detector”	660
10-3.4.2 The Future of the Guilty Knowledge Test ..	660
10-3.4.3 To Accept the Pro-Polygraph Arguments, One Must Believe	661
Chapter 11. DNA Typing	664
A. Legal Issues	665
11-1.0 The Legal Relevance of DNA Tests	665
11-1.1 Introduction	665
11-1.2 Objections to DNA Evidence	667
11-1.2.1 Historical Overview	668
11-1.2.2 Ascertaining DNA Matches	673
11-1.2.3 Presenting Incriminating DNA Results	676
11-1.2.5 Proficiency Test Records	688
11-1.3 Relevant Expertise	695
B. Scientific Status	697
11-2.0 The Scientific Status of DNA Typing	697
11-2.1 Overview of Variation in DNA and Its Detection	697
11-2.1.1 DNA, Chromosomes, Sex, and Genes	697
11-2.1.2 Types of Polymorphisms and Methods of Detection	699
11-2.2 DNA Profiling with Discrete Alleles	702
11-2.2.1 DNA Extraction and Amplification	702
11-2.2.2 DNA Analysis	703
11-2.3 VNTR Profiling	705
11-2.3.1 Validity of the Underlying Scientific Theo- ry	707
11-2.3.2 Validity and Reliability of the Laboratory Techniques	707
11-2.4 Sample Quantity and Quality	708
11-2.4.1 Did the Sample Contain Enough DNA?	708
11-2.4.2 Was the Sample of Sufficient Quality?	710
11-2.4.3 Does a Sample Contain DNA from More than One Person?	712
11-2.5 Laboratory Performance	712
11-2.5.1 Quality Control and Assurance	712
11-2.5.2 Handling Samples	715
11-2.6 Interpretation of Laboratory Results	719
11-2.6.1 Exclusions, Inclusions, and Inconclusive Results	719
11-2.6.2 Alternative Hypotheses	721
11-2.2.3 Measures of Probative Value	733
11-2.7 Novel Applications of DNA Technology	736
11-2.7.1 Is the Application Novel?	737
11-2.7.2 Is the Underlying Scientific Theory Valid? ..	739

	Page
B. Scientific Status—Continued	
11-2.7.3 Has the Probability of a Chance Match Been Estimated Correctly?	742
11-2.7.4 What Is the Relevant Scientific Communi- ty?	745
Chapter 12. Parentage Testing	762
A. Legal Issues	762
12-1.0 The Legal Relevance of Parentage Testing	762
12-1.1 Introduction	762
12-1.2 The Movement Toward Admissibility	764
12-1.3 New Tests	765
12-1.4 Weight of the Tests	767
12-1.5 The “Probability of Paternity”	769
12-1.6 The Uniform Parentage Act of 2000	771
12-1.7 Criminal Cases	774
B. Scientific Status	781
12-2.0 The Scientific Status of Parentage Testing	781
12-2.1 Introduction	781
12-2.2 Genetic Markers Used in Parentage Testing	782
12-2.3 Genetic Principles of Paternity Testing	785
12-2.4 Selection of Genetic Tests	788
12-2.5 Evaluation of the Significance of a Paternity Match ...	790
12-2.6 Principles and Assumptions Underlying W	793
12-2.6.1 General Principles and Assumptions	793
12-2.6.2 The Product Rule	794
12-2.7 Differences Between Disputed Paternity and Disput- ed Identity	794
12-2.7.1 Technical Differences	795
12-2.7.2 Genetic Differences	796
12-2.7.3 Computational Differences	797
12-2.8 Conclusion	798
INDEX	799